Pre-Service Teachers' Perceptions of Supervisor Feedback: Evaluating the Effectiveness of Teaching Practicum Support in Pakistan

Javaid Alam Khan[1], Dr. Rani Gul[2], Tahira Riaz[3], Shabana Bibi[4], Salman Ahmad[5]

[1]M.Phil. Scholar, Department of Education, University of Malakand, Chakdara
[2]Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Malakand, Chakdara
 (Corresponding Author) E-mail: ranigul@uom.edu.pk
[3]Departement of Education and Department of Psychology University of Malakand, Chakdara
[4]Lecturer, Department of Education, Bacha Khan University Charsadda
[5]PhD Scholar, Department of Education, University of Malakand, Chakdara

Abstract

This research examines the effects of feedback on the professional competence of pre-service teachers. This research aims to investigate the perceptions of pre-service teachers regarding the effectiveness of the feedback criteria employed by the supervisor during teaching practicum. The data for this research was collected through semi-structured interviews of students in their fourth and eighth semesters and their supervisors in the form of qualitative design. The findings emphasize the importance of providing organized, focused, and timely feedback in enhancing teaching skills. The research revealed that successful teaching focused on the establishment of clear learning objectives, detailed lesson designs, and optimal use of teaching aids. The student's involvement and the class interactions were greatly improved by feedback on time management, clarity of instruction, and the management of the classroom. The study also stresses the importance of the use of various assessment methods and the provision of feedback to students on time. There was some feedback concerning collaboration and professional conduct which seemed to improve professionalism and communication skills. Promoting reflective practice and flexibility in changing tasks seemed to promote continual progress. Recommendations include regular feedback sessions, digital tools, supervisor training, peer feedback in teacher education, and future studies on long-term effects to improve educational outcomes.

Keywords: Supervisor Feedback, Pre-Service Teachers, Teaching Practicum, Professional Development, Communication Skills, Feedback Effectiveness, Educational Training

Introduction

Education is the transfer of knowledge, abilities, and character qualities, which can manifest in a variety of ways. Formal education, which encompasses public schools, is characterized by a structured environment and an educational program. In contrast, informal education involves unstructured learning through regular occurrences, whereas non-formal education operates

outside of the traditional school system and employs a structured approach. Preschool, primary, secondary, and higher education are all educational levels. Instructional methods, such as teacher-centered and student-centered education, as well as fields such as science education, linguistics, and physical education, were the focus of additional categories. In addition, the term "education" denotes the academic field that examines the mental states and characteristics of educated individuals, as well as educational trends (*Ahmad & Gul, 2023; Bukhari et al., 2023;* Resch, 2023).

A practicum is a type of educational experience that equips students with the necessary skills to become educators. Students are provided with instruction to satisfy professional requirements from the outset of their academic careers. To be acknowledged as a qualified teacher, they must apply the knowledge they have acquired from teacher preparation institutes during school hours. Practicum is an opportunity to acquire knowledge about teacher responsibilities and instruction, rather than merely completing a list of skills and competencies (Ahmad et al., 2024a; Gul et al., 2022; Tufail et al., 2024). This justification underscores the role of practicum definitions in the professional development of teachers by identifying strategies that improve the effectiveness of student-teachers. The goal of this program is to guarantee that educators can capitalize on their newly acquired teaching abilities and establish a foundation for the realities of modern educational institutions. A substantial aspect of pre-service teacher preparation is the discussion of experiences in actual classroom environments. The Ethiopian Ministry of Education implemented numerous nationwide inspections to enhance and advance the teacher education system (Ahmad et al., 2024b; Gul & Khilji, 2021*;* Slade, 2019).

The practicum program was established to provide pre-service teachers with the requisite skills and confidence in the practical aspects of teaching in educational institutions. Even though pre-service teachers are primarily unaware of the difficulties they may encounter while teaching in educational institutions, they can address and overcome challenges that arise during their practicum through targeted supervisor feedback. University-based teacher trainers and educational teacher supervisors typically provide support to prospective teachers during the practicum as they navigate the irregular demands of teaching in classrooms. The concerns that pre-service teachers experience during the practicum are significant in that they contribute to the development of their employability skills and their awareness of effective teaching behaviors(Salm, 2016).

A teacher's education program is incomplete without a practicum. Pre-service teachers are anticipated to apply the concepts, guidelines, skills, and values they have acquired during instruction and receive continuous feedback from their supervisors to develop into competent and skilled educators. The teacher training program should consider the established opinions of pre-service teachers, as they have an impact on their learning. Pre-service teachers' evaluation and assessment of educational information, decision-making, and teaching practices are influenced by supervisor feedback *(Gul et al., 2021c; Shah Bukhari et al., 2022).* Many pre-service teachers are unprepared to confront the demands of their profession when their teaching practicum occurs, even though the teacher training program has provided a variety of concepts and methodologies. Consequently, it is crucial for supervisors to ascertain the perspectives of prospective teachers regarding the teaching practicum before their actual teaching experience and to motivate them to uphold these attitudes throughout the teacher training program (Zhou et al., 2022).

Feedback also has a social component, which promotes a positive learning environment. "Positive feedback" is a precise response that can also symbolize a positive outcome, in contrast to "negative feedback," which indicates an inaccurate approach and can indicate failure or inferior task performance. Every teacher who is committed to their profession aims to address the educational requirements of their students to enhance their performance. To accomplish their goals, the author uses a range of strategies and tactics, depending on student feedback. Teachers and students can identify areas for improvement and perform more effectively because of feedback, which is essential in educational procedures. Both within and outside of the educational environment, effective listening, or feedback, is an essential communication skill. It also enhances performance, inspires, and promotes learning (Tufail et al., 2024).

Practicum sessions are scheduled for the 3rd, 4th, 7th, and 8th semesters. During these periods, student teachers are employed in designated schools with university-appointed supervisors and senior schoolteachers serving as co-supervisors. This triadic model, involving the student-teacher, university supervisor, and co-supervisor, fosters collaboration and mutual learning. Initial triad meetings clarify roles and expectations, ensuring a shared understanding of objectives. Feedback is central to this process, as it helps prospective teachers refining their skills and enhance their teaching effectiveness. Sharing experiences through seminars and discussions further enriches the learning journey (Alam, 2021; Gul et al., 2020). The communication skills of student teachers are significantly improved by supervisor feedback, which provides constructive criticism regarding their plans and student-centered approach. This promotes a positive learning environment in the classroom, improves interpersonal relationships, and increases competitiveness in employment opportunities. Supervisors also encourage students to reflect, improve their teaching, and improve their capacity to make decisions that are pertinent to any employment (Shah Bukhari et al., 2022).

Statement of the Problem
This study aims to address these gaps by examining pre-service teachers' perceptions of current feedback practices and identifying challenges supervisors face in delivering efficient feedback. The research will focus on how supervisors use feedback mechanisms to support the development of fundamental employability skills in pre-service teachers during their practicum experiences.

Research Objectives

- To investigate pre-service teachers' belief systems about supervisor feedback throughout teaching practicum.

- To Identify the problems which supervisor feedback presents for pre-service teacher skill development and its consequences.

Significance of Study
This study aims to enhance teacher education programs in Pakistan by addressing two critical gaps in feedback practices during teaching practicums. Feedback is a fundamental component of professional practice, significantly influencing how pre-service teachers develop their teaching skills and interactive capabilities within the workplace. By exploring current perspectives and identifying the challenges associated with feedback practices, this study seeks to generate insights that can serve as the foundation for more structured and comprehensive feedback systems within teacher education institutions. This research aims to identify deficiencies in existing feedback systems and develop a standardized approach for pre-service teachers. It

encourages personalized feedback as it addresses different aspects of teaching. The results will also be useful in teacher training institutions and policy changes meant to support development and improve student performance through well-trained teachers competent in contemporary classrooms.

Literature Review

Theoretical Frameworks Related to Feedback in Education

Education, especially teacher training, is an area that relies heavily on feedback as a source of improvement and learning. Kolb identifies four stages of learning: activity, observing, reflecting, and doing. Feedback is also relevant across these stages, especially during a reflection on action and abstract conceptualization. It enables learners to assess errors and areas worthy of improvement. For example, feedback helps the teacher see what works in actual classrooms, and it makes them think about their practice of teaching and changing it according to what they see. This theory explains that feedback is necessary for development and learning processes in the context of education (Kolb, 2014).

According to Walker's Structured Reflection Model (Gul et al., 2023; Khan et al., 2023), reflective practice is of fundamental importance in pedagogy. Students are instructed to care about the feedback received, as well as the self-regulatory responses and assessments stimulated by it. This model advocates feedback on such traineeship practices as student teaching, classroom control, and pupils' participation, thereby improving the teaching practice of future teachers. This is also the case with Vygotsky's ZPD, which is also fundamental to educational processes connected with feedback. The model delineates ZPD as the region where the learner's best independent performance does not exceed the most challenging task but can be accomplished with help. For example, feedback has a 'scaffolding' function in the sense that it enables learners to do what they would not be able to do without assistance. Incorporating feedback in line with the ZPD in teacher education contributes to the student teachers' more effective performance thus fostering their professional growth and fitness for more sophisticated supplies of teaching techniques (Sage, 2022).

Evans (2013) examines evaluation feedback in higher learning from 2000 to 2012, focusing on students' academic work from various sources. The study examines gaps in literature, feedback types, and discourses, and the feedback divides. Khan et al. (2023) emphasizes the importance of providing helpful feedback to students to boost motivation, self-assurance, and independence, ultimately improving learning results. The study proposes a theoretical framework using value theory, goal-oriented theory, behaviorism perspective, and behavioral constructivist autonomous theory. The strategy promotes students' academic performance and self-regulation, ultimately achieving their educational goals. Ahmad et al. (2024) defines feedback literacy as understanding the roles and objectives of feedback, obtaining information, evaluating work quality, regulating sensations, and analyzing and using information for subsequent tasks. This understanding can help students improve their education and understanding of feedback operations. Gul et al., (2021a) critically analyzes the interaction between feedback and evaluation in higher education institutions, addressing six issues caused by the entwinement of evaluation and feedback: students' scores as their primary concern, comments supporting scores instead of learning outcomes, insufficient feedback, prioritizing feedback over other course designs, documented feedback, and less importance of feedback. Strategies to maintain feedback's ability to impart knowledge include emphasizing feedback within learning cycles.

Feedback Practices in Teacher Education

Feedback is an important component of teacher education because it grows and develops their self-efficacy. It gives pre-service teachers focused criticism and input, whereby the criterion set forth is geared towards a professional development need. According to Han (2020), teacher feedback on criticism is a crucial factor in enhancing student feedback skills in higher education institutions. This was also relevant in research involving Chinese master's students, where the beliefs and depths of expertise of the students improved at different levels and rates. Motivation, beliefs, and language skills among other characteristics determined how different students would react to the feedback given to them. It can be observed that varying forms of feedback within teacher training programs assist in preparing effective, critical, and flexible teachers.

Banihashem (2022) examined the potential of knowledge analytics to improve feedback processes in higher education, identifying four key elements of learning analytic systems: what (data types), how (analytic methodologies), why (aims), and how stakeholders and teachers receive assistance from learning analytics. The study aimed to present a theoretical framework for applying learning in feedback processes and provide recommendations for further empirical studies. Bukhari et al. (2023) investigated the significance of teacher feedback proficiency, developing a framework for understanding teacher feedback understanding competency using transcripts from two prior studies' focus groups and interviews. The study examined the various proficiencies needed for various responsibilities, including developing courses and providing feedback on students' assignments.

Sanchez (2024) examines how an English-speaking teacher in Argentina handles written feedback and how behavior is influenced by educational objectives. The results demonstrate how different educational intentions, some specifically related to language arts, and others not specifically related to this field have an impact on teachers' feedback practices. The thermoanalytical aspects of Gul & Khilji (2021) new model for key comprehension of teachers' assessment and feedback procedures for reporting literacy are examined.

Role of Supervisors in Teaching Practicums

Supervisors are widely recognized as significant contributors to the professional development of pre-service teachers. Senior educators play a crucial role in the teaching profession, not only in conveying pedagogical theories but also in guiding and evaluating their students throughout the learning process. Supervisors play a vital role in providing emotional and professional support to trainees, helping them build their teaching identities and enhancing job satisfaction and commitment (Latifah, 2014). Gul et al., (2021b) noted that technology has improved the feedback process during teaching practicums, allowing for more intense and timely feedback, and allowing supervisors to provide more detail about their input and corrections. This technology will help change the situation where theory and practice are not directly connected, and trainees will have access to resources that will help them improve their teaching practice by increasing efficiency. The Notre Dame Institute of Education (NDIE) Practicum significantly enhanced student teachers' practical teaching skills from 2007 to 2008. Russell (2017) investigated practicum supervisors' roles and how their supervisory experiences affect the professional development of pre-service secondary teachers. Pre-service teachers gather information during triadic supervision from both formal and informal sources, such as emails, notes, and observations. The study focuses on trustworthiness, a sense of purpose for individuals, and relevance to teacher education.

Al-Momani (2016) examined practicum issues from supervisors' points of view throughout the faculty of education. The findings showed that teaching in a secondary school, the absence of innovative teaching resources, supervision, and administrative strain are among the difficulties faced by teachers of learners. The use of external sources, educational assistance, mistreatment of school administration, isolation, a lack of subject comprehension, a challenging curriculum, a brief educational period, student-school cooperation, the relationship between knowledge and practice, and practical use in the classroom were some of the challenges supervisors had to deal with.

Feedback and Skill Development
Feedback plays a crucial role in the development of employability skills, as it helps pre-service teachers apply theory in the classroom. Feedback can enhance coping skills such as critical thinking, problem-solving, flexibility, communication, and teamwork. Pre-service teachers need to adjust their teaching strategies to foster professional growth and develop essential employability skills (Stahl, 2017). Malecka (2022) highlights three main strategies for integrating feedback skills into the undergraduate curriculum: eliciting, manufacturing, and implementing. The study emphasizes the need for further investigations on the effects of educational programming on students' development of communication skills and additional evidence on how students generate, perceive, and employ feedback in real-time. Gul et al. (2022) investigates the quantity of feedback and its impact on the learning of skills in LISP education. The findings indicate that immediate feedback accelerates overall learning but also causes less efficiency and more mistakes. Delayed feedback promotes the growth of supplementary skills such as identifying mistakes and self-correction, which are essential for achievement after feedback has been removed. The timing and method of providing feedback have a significant impact on how it is received. Immediate feedback following an observational teaching session can help correct and improve the learning curve. Wu (2021) agrees that timely feedback is more likely to be accepted and implemented as immediate practice adjustments, improving instructional quality. Self-reflection promotes a critical focus on students' learning.

Nel (2021) discusses the impact of COVID-19 on student teachers' dissatisfaction with their tutors' feedback. The goal of this exploratory case study is to investigate how student teachers perceive the use of a social annotation platform to improve teamwork during the teaching practicum's "practice-based learning" phase. Gul et al. (2021) emphasizes the importance of self-inquiry processes and cooperative debate in teaching as a caring community of practice. This article discusses the challenges faced by first-year pre-service teachers during a program designed to develop fundamental pedagogical practices like peer reflection and criticism. The article concludes by emphasizing the significance of evaluation and feedback in one's early professional development stages.

Challenges in Implementing Effective Feedback Practices
Effective feedback practices in teacher education programs can be challenging due to systemic resource and organizational limitations, as well as relational factors that strain the supervisor-trainee dynamic. Supervisors often struggle with time constraints, which impact their ability to conduct high-quality observation, assessment, and feedback. In today's fast-paced educational environment, both time and focused attention are scarce, making it difficult to sustain a constructive feedback process (Prilop, 2019). Another significant challenge is the supervisors' ability to provide appropriate feedback, as they may not all be born great communicators. This can result in feedback being either excessively negative or ambiguous, giving trainees little or no

direction on how to improve. Training supervisors on how and when to provide feedback that promotes learning and development is crucial (Castanelli, 2020).

Neupane (2021) acknowledges that a comprehensively planned feedback approach can help bridge some of these gaps, but such standardization is often difficult to implement. Resources, student population, and institutional goals are some of the factors that may have a significant impact on the applicability of a universal feedback framework that is perceived to be effective in all situations. Different learning contexts will require different types of feedback procedures, and it is important to distinguish between native and non-native speakers. According to Gul et al. (2020), a major impediment is a lack of comprehensive supervisory training on how to provide appropriate feedback. Supervisors are considered professional teachers, but many are not specifically trained in mentorship and feedback delivery. The lack of systematic development suggests that supervisors may be unaware of current teaching or feedback strategies that could improve their efficiency. Institutional change may also impede the practice of providing standardized feedback. Routine procedures, for example, are deeply embedded in specific cultures within the educational system, and academics may be hesitant to propose alternative feedback techniques or instruments. Fullan (2015) emphasizes the difficulties involved in subverting educational practices, stating that simply offering new techniques and approaches is insufficient to effect appropriate change; a cultural shift is also required.

Hussain (2019) investigated the rating system for Khyber Pakhtunkhwa English teachers who observe their students, finding that the most commonly used teaching methods are question-and-answer sessions, homework assignments, oral presentations, and objective tests. However, they also noted time management, lack of training programs, overcrowded classrooms, and ensuring the psychometric properties of an assessment tool as some of the challenges. Opportunities for improvement include workshop sessions, the use of flip learning methods, a teacher's center of excellence, university education departments, and experienced teachers. Fonseca (2015) found that performance, self-regulation, educational engagement, and teacher-student relationships all depend on feedback, but teachers rarely utilize it effectively. To increase teachers' comprehension of feedback mechanisms and how to use them, extended training was conducted, which enhanced engagement, knowledge, competencies, and favorable attitudes about feedback procedures.

Determining the extent to which feedback influences a trainee's development can be challenging, making consistent feedback practices difficult to implement. Gul et al. (2023) proposes that evaluation processes must be planned and detailed, but they must be done correctly. To address these challenges, managers must be equipped with the skills and strategies necessary to establish consistent feedback practices in various pedagogical contexts, while also thanking institutions for providing an environment that fosters professional growth in pedagogical aspects. These changes will allow educational institutions to raise the standards of their teacher training programs and ensure that all pre-service teachers receive the growth-oriented feedback they need to become successful educators.

Research Methodology

Nature of the Study
This study used qualitative research methods to gain valuable insights into the causes of various life problems by investigating all aspects of one person's actions, experiences, and beliefs. W. L

Creswell (2017) conducts exploratory, descriptive research to understand human and other behavioral phenomena. This approach was chosen primarily because of the discussed changes to the study design, as well as its flexibility and ability to track the participant's emotional states and important contextual information that quantitative methods would miss. This approach was appropriate for the research because it allowed for the evaluation of various feedback procedures used in teaching practicum sessions.

Population
The participants were teachers and students from the Faculty of Education at the University of Malakand and the University of Swat, with a focus on transforming students in their fourth and eight semesters the supervisors were also included as research participants, as data was collected from them as well. The reason for choosing these two semesters in particular was to give students experience at opposite ends of the program. The University of Swat had 27 students in the fourth semester and 16 in the eight, whereas the University of Malakand had 34 and 39 students in the fourth and eight semesters, respectively.

Sample
The purposive random sampling technique was employed because the selected percentage of the sample is representative of the sample population. The method of sampling makes it possible for the study to produce accurate results since it takes into consideration each segment of the population. According to the survey, adopted a 30% sample size, which is statistically powerful enough without much time consumption during data collection and analysis (Gay, 2012).The final sample contained:

Subgroups	Population		Sample	
	4th Semester	8th Semester	4th Semester	8th Semester
Department of Education, University of Swat	27	16	8	5
Department of Education, University of Malakand	34	39	10	12
Total	71	55	18	17

Research Instrument
This study used a semi-structured interview tool, which is both effective and simple to use for data collection. The interviews were kept open-ended, similar to the structure of the questions asked, while respondents were expected to provide detailed perspectives or opinions on aspects that had not been identified. It is especially useful when investigating phenomena such as feedback in teaching practicums because it sheds light on the impact of social factors and feedback culture on outcomes.

Data Collection Procedure
The data collection procedures were thoroughly reviewed to ensure that there were no ethical or methodological errors. Participants received two directed cover letters to help them prepare for the study. It contains the research study's objectives, the participants' obligations, and the protections that are in place to ensure that their information is kept confidential. Following

agreement from the respondents, the face-to-face interviews were mostly semistructured, covering the necessary issues while also allowing the respondents to express their opinions.

Data Analysis

Braun and Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis was used to examine the data gathered during the interviews. This method is appropriate for qualitative research because it is both systematic and flexible, allowing for exploration and explanation after identifying and describing patterns in the data. The steps in Braun and Clarke's six-phase approach include familiarization with the material, generation of first-order codes, theme location, theme review, theme definition and naming, and report writing. This approach allowed us to focus on various aspects of feedback, such as its role in the professional development of future teachers, which enhanced our understanding of the phenomenon under study.

Findings

This section contains the findings from semi-structured interviews of supervisors and pre-service teachers from the University of Malakand and the University of Swat Education Department. It was highlighted. How do pre-service teachers in Pakistan perceive the effectiveness of current feedback used during teaching practicum by supervisors. The analysis of the data was performed by applying the same thematic approach devised by Braun and Clarke (2006).

Perceptions of Pre-Service Teachers on Feedback Effectiveness

Pre-service teachers, through a clear lesson objective, were also able to improve their understanding of the teaching objectives which enabled them to devise strategies and relate them to the intended learning outcomes. The supervisors had a crucial role in assisting them in determining if these goals were clear and reflected their needs, and they also thought the evaluation criteria that they contributed to developing were useful. A participant (ST1) described it as follows: "Observing the lessons gave me a feeling of my lesson objectives and kept me on track with the material as well as a check for students that we shared the same goal." An additional individual (ST2) responded to the tweet by stating, "The feedback on my objectives has been instrumental in assisting me in determining the objectives I wish to accomplish with the lessons and the best methods for integrating with my students."

Supervisors (SUP1) frequently recommended or implemented instructional strategies to accommodate the diverse learning requirements of students. This method was appealing to pre-service teachers because it inspired them to establish inclusive classrooms. "The utilization of numerous lesson planning techniques was highly beneficial in attracting and retaining a significant number of students," stated one of the participants. This feedback serves as an incentive for educators to establish inclusive learning environments that ensure that all students have a place to participate. It was helpful to pre-service teachers to get feedback regarding the utilization of resources and other teaching aids to improve the quality of teaching lessons. In one of the cases, a pre-service teacher expressed that comments made regarding their use of different teaching aids and resources helped them to identify potential ways of increasing the practicality and effectiveness in terms of making their lessons more effective and practical for their students. This feedback motivated the use of multimedia, visual aids, and other resources to help lessons be more engaging and usable. It resulted in a more focused educational experience and much higher student engagement.

However, pre-service teachers received training on constructive criticism as part of their education on classroom management and discipline. In a well-structured, calm learning environment, feedback on behavior management strategies provided useful strategies that led to increased expertise. Other participants (ST3) stated: It was particularly crucial to get feedback on behavior management strategies. This assisted in developing techniques to stop disruptive behavior and maintain a positive environment in the classroom". It was challenging for pre-service teachers to establish a positive classroom environment. Techniques to boost participation were created, along with specific exercises to encourage good student conduct and feedback to enhance inclusivity generally. One participant (SUP2) stated, "A supervisor gave great advice about creating an inclusive classroom. Actually, I managed to figure out how to make every student feel like they belonged to the class's family".

The teacher training program offered effective, realistic, constructive, and positive feedback. As one of the participants (ST6) stated: "It is useful to know what kind of feedback you can offer on time". It encouraged student participation and reflection; pre-service teachers were able to comprehend the expectations of the students and offer guidance on how to improve their performance. Teachers need to be able to talk to student's coworkers and superiors professionally, through effective communication. One participant (SUP 4) stated: "I valued the criticism I received on my communication skills because it lets you know how important it is to communicate well in class." This increased their ability to interact with students and subsequently created a more lasting practice for students. Feedback from the pre-service teachers' peers proved especially helpful in working to strengthen and improve their teaching. They truly appreciated criticism that pushed them to think about themselves and provided resources to assist them in developing their careers. According to one participant (SUP 2), "It was a turning point in the self-reflection feedback. I learned to consider my teaching strategies critically and aim for ways to improve them."

Challenges in Feedback Provision
Supervisor feedback is important for the professional development of Pre Service Teachers. So, in this process there are a lot of challenges and feedback may not always work. Problems such as mixed feedback, generalization, and delays were shown to limit preservice teachers' ability to make timely and effective modifications to their teaching strategies "The feedback I received sometimes was about just criticizing without directions." a participant said. I was frustrated by some of the modifications which were mischaracterized as an enhancement. This lack of knowledge led Pre-Service teachers to sometimes not be sure how to make improvements. According to one participant (ST8), "I felt like I was doing everything wrong, but I didn't know how to do things differently". This is a great example of what can happen when the feedback does not point out how to solve the problem.

Another issue of concern mentioned by pre-service teachers was inconsistent feedback. A participant (ST9) noted that "Each of the supervisors appeared to have different criteria regarding evaluation. When you did not know what to do, situations became complicated." The criteria for feedback may not be uniform either, making it difficult for pre-service teachers to adopt a consistent approach in their methodological practices. Another participant (ST10) said, "I remember how it was hard to sit for comments that dealt not with real problems. By the time the comments came the adaptations I was supposed to make were still unclear". Feedback from the supervisors that is given in an appropriate manner and at the right time can enable pre-service trainees to quickly adjust and therefore do better next time.

This modern approach highlights the role of technology in making feedback more communicable and sent in a shorter time. A respondent (ST11) in the study observed, "By integrating websites in feedback provision, it will enhance the level of organization and complement precision in timing and responding to the questions with focus." To these respondents, there was a wide range of options, which were available to be used in the feedback stage for the pre-service teachers. This is correct to one of the respondents (SUP2) in the research who stated, "Supervisors should be trained to provide clear guidance and general advice on what was done well and what needs to be improved". This would make the feedback more relevant to our professional growth as educators. This will make sure that the feedback provided during the formative assessment process is more focused on the professional development of the teachers, which will ensure that pre-service teachers receive the necessary guidance to enhance their teaching.

Supervisor's Perspective on Feedback Provision
Supervisors contribute significantly to the education of teachers by overseeing them during their training sessions; however, they have the additional mission of being departmental heads, teachers, and trainers as well. One of the supervisors (SUP2) stated that it was challenging to provide a detailed assessment due to other responsibilities, as well as the need to cooperate with all student teachers at once. This often results in a large number of superficial remarks, which diminishes the effectiveness of the teacher training institution.

A further important consideration is the timely and efficient receipt of the feedback. There is concern in the literature regarding the slowness in the provision of some feedback, which is problematic for pre-service teachers who require feedback to make changes straight away. A supervisor (SUP3) explained, "Managing time is crucial and challenging. The comments should be delivered with urgency, but there is often no time to do so." This emphasizes the need to identify mechanisms for time management that would facilitate swift and effective feedback.

Recommendation training is another crucial component of effective feedback. Supervisors are sure that by engaging in ongoing professional development, they will be able to give insightful feedback. According to one supervisor (SUP3), "learning feedback techniques is helpful, it helps us learn new skills and improve existing ones, ensuring that the feedback we provide is of the highest quality". This kind of ongoing professional development can assist in the overall training of in-service teachers as well as help them create more impactful feedback. Feedback aims to improve pre-service teachers' foundational abilities, including communication, creativity, and teamwork, by providing and incorporating technical skills, induction activities, and practical strategies. One supervisor (SUP1) observed that "both feedback sessions and orientation are effective in increasing verbal communication. The fundamental skills taught by these methods can be applied right away in the pre-service teacher's future classroom". A teacher's performance is typically evaluated based on both verbal and nonverbal communication, as well as the in-service teacher's capacity for continuous improvement. The significance of this was emphasized by one supervisor (SUP5), who stated, "Evaluation of oral and body language projection is crucial. It helps aspiring educators discover the most effective methods for communicating with their students and disseminating knowledge". These assessments are becoming more and more significant in helping pre-service teachers improve their communication skills, which will increase their likelihood of becoming successful professionals in the future.

Summary of the Findings
The evaluation revealed that feedback allows to enhance pre-service teacher preparation by facilitating the formulation of definite learning goals, lesson planning, resource use, and effective classroom organization. Supervisors also praised beneficial management skills and effective instruction practices. The information related to teamwork and effectiveness, including the capacity of the individual to communicate, enhances the environment for learning.

Discussion and Conclusion

Discussion
The research analyses the responses regarding the enhancement of decision-making skills amongst pre-service teachers providing supporting evidence for the effective definition of lesson objectives and goals. It argues that pre-service teachers ought to avoid such situations and instead concentrate on the creation of learning content with clear target objectives. The research also highlights the role of lesson plans in assisting with the management of the classroom and the teaching techniques to be used. The use of feedback aids in the correct integration of teaching aids or resources, enhancing the efficiency of teaching methods employed. This agrees with Lee's (2014) findings that there are increased levels of student participation and performance as a result of the effective distribution of available resources. Pre-service teachers also have a strong tendency to seek recommendations on how to approach available resources in a more original manner which is consistent with Badilla (2017) who strongly supports the innovation of resources at all levels of education.

The feedback was noted to be helpful, especially in the management of class time. With better time management tips, the pre-service teachers were able to organize their lessons more appropriately and execute the intended objectives. This substantiates Juhler's (2017) discovery that student outcomes can be enhanced if there is better time management by the instructor in the lessons. Time management strategies and explanations of the importance of time management for intervening during instruction were provided to pre-service teachers. This helped them accomplish their objectives and manage their classes.

Furthermore, feedback oriented toward decreasing confusion among students surfaced as an important aspect of enhancing instructional quality. Pre-service teachers commented that once they were provided with feedback on how to improve the clarity of their instructions, the way they communicated with their students changed significantly. This finding complements Mok's (2021) claim that to teach ethically, teachers need to use orality. Furthermore, it was also stated that by targeting more students with complex topics which made them more straightforward, students became engaged more proactively, consistent with Maulana's (2017) focus on the importance of a student-centered environment aimed at increased learning and results of students.

The findings suggest instructive engagements in the instructional communication strategies together with feedback on strategies that involved students' participation was highly appreciated by pre-service teachers. They preferred a more regular use of various strategies focusing on active participation, for instance, several ways of teaching, which supports previous studies. It has been noted in research that students engaging in learning promotes learning and improves academic achievement. Based on the responses received, it can be argued that it is necessary to create an engagement strategy following Nissim (2016) that highlights the obligation of teachers

to cater to the diverse needs of the students in an appropriate environment and without compromising other educational objectives.

A further key aspect indicated in the feedback was the notion of directing students, which was centered on the concept of adjusting. Pre-service teachers were then reported on their aspects of instructional flexibility, both weaknesses and strengths. This is supported by Gümüş's (2019) study, which emphasizes that teachers should provide education that meets the different needs and expectations of students. The adjustment of pre-service teachers in the light of feedback and their willingness to change their teaching for the benefit of students is in line with other studies that stress the significance of flexibility in one's teaching practices.

The feedback pointed out such significant professional practices as attendance, class organization, as well as ethical behavior. Students who were in the final stage of their education training expressed satisfaction with this feedback since it motivated them to develop such indispensable professional behaviors. These developments align with Leinonen's (2017) research that showed how trust and respect are earned in the profession, in this case, that of a teacher. Comments made by participants on how they became more responsible in their role as teachers due to the professional ethics feedback offered insight into the role of professional identity within the academic community of educators.

One particularly valuable piece of feedback was that related to self-evaluation of teaching activities, which assisted pre-service teachers in determining the most and least effective aspects of their instruction. Self-evaluation and subsequent correction were brought up as areas of concern by the participants. This corresponds to Dayal's (2020) study where self-reflection was identified as one of the key building blocks for lifelong development. The noticeable effect on the professional development of the participants was clear as they stated that they used self-reflection to evaluate their respective teaching strategies alongside external evaluation, which a common practice is advocated for by the growing body of literature on self-evaluation in education.

The research underlines the need for an individual to appreciate constructive criticism, provided that it comes from a superior or a colleague for professional growth. Pre-service teachers have expressed that feedback given to them regarding their politeness prepared them for self-enhancement strategies in the future. This corresponds with the work of Akcan (2010), which also underlined the benefits of being open to feedback and change. Participants acquired the quality called resilience by receiving, pondering on negative comments, and modifying their actions. A professional has to possess a healthy regard for self-improvement. Pre-service teachers endorsed the attempts to enhance the quality of the instructional process through the use of reflection and feedback, which improved them as professionals. This follows the findings of Beveridge (2020) on the upward trends in the teaching profession.

The findings of the study underscore the necessity for instruction to be responsive to the differing learning contexts, with the pre-service teachers commenting on the benefits of being given feedback on differentiation strategies. This supports Dee's (2010) study which focused on the promotion of equity and inclusion in education. Respondents also provided feedback on strategies for fostering an inclusive classroom environment. Some student teachers indicated that the comments on inclusiveness encouraged them to be more considerate of and work more towards the success of their learners. The results are consistent with those of Cutler (2022) which indicate that active participation of students is highly correlated with the level of inclusiveness of

the classroom environment. Finally, feedback is important in developing the professionalism and the teaching practices of pre-service teachers. It gives information on the aims of the lesson, its structure, what resources would be used, classroom organization, different approaches, how learners were engaged, how flexible the lesson was, and how learners' achievements were assessed. It also emphasizes the need for dealing with moral and ethical issues in the teaching of content. In this way, feedback assists teachers in adjusting their practices to fit students' various characteristics and needs to achieve more productive and inclusive learning environments.

Conclusion

This research investigates possible implementational feedback practices as a tool for skill development among pre-service teachers. It argues that there should be feedback provided at various levels such as a lesson, classroom, professional, student, self, instruction, and self-evaluation. The expectation of feedback would also be highlighted in aspects of organization, attention, time, and the design and implementation of professional and teaching skills. The Sequential McMillan framework is also employed by teachers which contains explicit statements of expected learning outcomes for students given at the beginning of the lessons. This helps to keep the lessons focused while also requiring students to actively participate. Well-designed lesson plans that include several stages of feedback also guarantee that every point of the lesson corresponds with each of the objectives readily set by the students and that the students have grasped the central ideas that they are meant to learn.

Constructive feedback during instructional activities is essential for gaining valuable experience in managing the learning environment. More practical ideas for organizing class activities make it easier for pre-service teachers to plan the time and activities required to meet the guiding objectives. They must also use appropriate pedagogical communication techniques to capture students' attention and instill learning. Furthermore, feedback on misunderstandings and communication skills enables a pre-service teacher to tailor the instructions more effectively. Feedback is a powerful tool for assisting and evaluating students' understanding as well as the extent of their learning. Suggestions for nurturing and using various types of assessment also contribute to a more appropriate evaluation process. Giving students appropriate and accurate feedback at the time when they are learning is critical for increasing student motivation and improving the teaching process.

Future Recommendations

The investigation has identified several recommendations for future teacher education programs.

- **Ministry of Education & Teacher Training Institutions:** Introduce regular and constructive feedback sessions for pre-service teachers, using digital tools to facilitate the process.
- **Educational Policy Makers & Curriculum Developers:** Teacher Educators & Professional Development Units: Provide training for supervisors on how to deliver precise and effective feedback as part of teacher education programs.
- **Educational Researchers & Higher Education Institutions:** Incorporate reflective study practices into teacher preparation to encourage ongoing improvement in teaching skills and understanding of feedback.
- **Teacher Training Institutions & Research Organizations:** Focus more on feedback in teacher education by researching to understand its effects on teaching effectiveness and student outcomes.

- **School Administrators & Teacher Training Programs:** Study how feedback influences various teaching skills over time to identify specific areas for development.
- Consider using peer feedback as an additional approach to complement supervisor feedback, fostering collaboration and enhancing the learning experience for teacher trainees.

Reference

Ahmad, I., & Gul, R. (2023). Impact of online service-learning on civic and social justice behavior of undergraduate laboratory-based graduates. *Human Arenas, 6(3)*, 639-654. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42087-023-00286-2

Ahmad, I., Gul, R., & Kashif, M. (2024a). A qualitative study of workplace factors causing stress among university teachers and coping strategies a qualitative study of workplace factors. *Human Arenas, 7(4)*, 812-834. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42087-024-00367-4

Ahmad, I., Gul, R., & Zeb, M. (2024b). A qualitative inquiry of university student's experiences of exam stress and its effect on their academic performance. *Human Arenas, 7(4)*, 778-788. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42087-024-00368-5

Akcan, S., & Tatar, S. (2010). An investigation of the nature of feedback given to pre-service English teachers during their practice teaching experience. *Teacher Development,* 14(2), 153-172.

Alam, M. J., Haque, A. K. M., &Banu, A. (2021). Academic supervision for improving quality education in primary schools of Bangladesh: Concept, issues and implications. *Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies,* 14(4), 1-12.

Al-Momani, F. (2016). Challenges of practicum at college of education: Supervisors & students' teachers perspective. *International Journal of Novel Research in Humanity and Social Sciences,* 3(3), 45-52.

Archer, J., Cantrell, S., Holtzman, S. L., Joe, J. N., Tocci, C. M., & Wood, J. (2016). *Better feedback for better teaching: A practical guide to improving classroom observations.* John Wiley & Sons.

Badilla Quintana, M. G., Vera Sagredo, A., &Lytras, M. D. (2017). Pre-service teachers' skills and perceptions about the use of virtual learning environments to improve teaching and learning. *Behaviour& information technology*, 36(6), 575-588.

Banihashem, S. K., Noroozi, O., Van Ginkel, S., Macfadyen, L. P., &Biemans, H. J. (2022). A systematic review of the role of learning analytics in enhancing feedback practices in higher education. *Educational Research Review*, 37, 100489.

Beveridge, L. (2020). *Witnessing a mosaic emerge: The phenomenon of transformative learning within a professional master's degree program*.

Boud, D., & Dawson, P. (2023). What feedback literate teachers do: an empirically-derived competency framework. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 48(2), 158-171.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology,* 3(2), 77–101.

Bukhari, S. K. U. S., Gul, R., Bashir, T., Zakir, S., & Javed, T. (2023). RETRACTED ARTICLE: Exploring managerial skills of Pakistan Public Universities (PPUs)'middle managers for campus sustainability. *Journal of Sustainable Finance & Investment, 13(1)*, 73-91. https://doi.org/10.1080/20430795.2023.2180806

Carless, D. (2022). From teacher transmission of information to student feedback literacy: Activating the learner role in feedback processes. *Active Learning in Higher Education, 23(2)*, 143-153.

Castanelli, D. J., Weller, J. M., Molloy, E., &Bearman, M. (2020). Shadow systems in assessment: how supervisors make progress decisions in practice. *Advances in Health Sciences Education,* 25, 131-147.

Clark, I. (2012). Formative assessment: Assessment is for self-regulated learning. *Educational psychology review,* 24, 205-249.

Cutler, B., Adams, M., & Jenkins, L. (2022). Working towards LGBTIQ-inclusive education: perceptions of pre-service teachers' comfort and emotional experience. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education,* 50(3), 295-310.

Dayal, H. C., &Alpana, R. (2020). Secondary pre-service teachers' reflections on their micro-teaching: Feedback and self-evaluation. *Waikato Journal of Education*, 25, 73-83.

Dee, A. L. (2010). Preservice teacher application of differentiated instruction. *The Teacher Educator,* 46(1), 53-70.

Evans, C. (2013). Making sense of assessment feedback in higher education. *Review of educational research,* 83(1), 70-120.

Fonseca, J., Carvalho, C., Conboy, J., Valente, M. O., Gama, A. P., Salema, M. H., &Fiuza, E. (2015). Changing teachers' feedback practices: A workshop challenge. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education (Online),* 40(8), 59-82.

Fullan, M. (2015). *The new meaning of educational change.* Teachers college press.

Gul, R., & Khilji, G. (2021). Exploring the need for a responsive school curriculum to cope with the Covid-19 pandemic in Pakistan. *Prospects, 51(1)*, 503-522. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-021-09578-8

Gul, R., Ayub, A., Mazhar, S., Uddin, S. S., & Khanum, M. (2021c). Teachers' perceptions on students' cultural and linguistic diversity and its impact on their approaches towards culturally teaching practices. *TESOL International Journal, 16(3-2)*, 1-15.

Gümüş, H. (2019). *An investigation into pre-service teachers' writing difficulties and their views and preferences on tutors' written feedback* (Master's thesis, PamukkaleÜniversitesiEğitimBilimleriEnstitüsü).

Han, Y., & Xu, Y. (2020). The development of student feedback literacy: the influences of teacher feedback on peer feedback. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 45(5), 680-696.

Hussain, S., Shaheen, N., Ahmad, N., & Islam, S. U. (2019). Teachers' classroom assessment practices: challenges and opportunities to classroom teachers in Pakistan. *Dialogue*, 14(1), 88-97.

Juhler, M. V. (2017). *Educating Pre-service Science Teachers. Promoting PCK development through the use of Lesson Study combined with Content Representation*,(March).

Khan, H., Gul, R., & Zeb, M. (2023). The effect of students' cognitive and emotional engagement on students' academic success and academic productivity. *Journal of Social Sciences Review, 3(1)*, 322-334.

Khan, M. A., Khan, M. A., & Khan, M. A. (2010). Assessing quality of teacher education: A student perspective. *International Journal of Educational Management, 24*(7), 586-600.

Kolb, D. A. (2014). *Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development.* FT press.

Latifah, D. (2014). The role of in-service teacher in supervising pre-service teachers during teaching practicum program. *Harmonia: Journal of Arts Research and Education*, 14(2), 88-96.

Lee, Y., & Lee, J. (2014). Enhancing pre-service teachers' self-efficacy beliefs for technology integration through lesson planning practice. *Computers & education*, 73, 121-128.

Leinonen, J. (2017). Pre-service foreign language teachers' expectations of their studies and teacher profession (Master's thesis).

Malecka, B., Boud, D., & Carless, D. (2022). Eliciting, processing and enacting feedback: mechanisms for embedding student feedback literacy within the curriculum. *Teaching in Higher Education, 27*(7), 908-922.

Maulana, R., Helms-Lorenz, M., & Van de Grift, W. (2017). Validating a model of effective teaching behaviour of pre-service teachers. *Teachers and Teaching, 23*(4), 471-493.

Mok, S. Y., &Staub, F. C. (2021). Does coaching, mentoring, and supervision matter for pre-service teachers' planning skills and clarity of instruction? A meta-analysis of (quasi-) experimental studies. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 107, 103484.

Molloy, E. K., &Boud, D. (2014). Feedback models for learning, teaching and performance. *Handbook of research on educational communications and technology,* 413-424.

Nel, C., & Marais, E. (2021). Addressing the wicked problem of feedback during the teaching practicum. *Perspectives in Education, 39*(1), 410-426.

Nissim, Y., Weissblueth, E., Scott-Webber, L., & Amar, S. (2016). The effect of a stimulating learning environment on pre-service teachers' motivation and 21st century skills. *Journal of Education and Learning,* 5(3), 29-39.

Prilop, C. N., Weber, K. E., &Kleinknecht, M. (2019). How digital reflection and feedback environments contribute to pre-service teachers' beliefs during a teaching practicum. *Studies in Educational Evaluation,* 62, 158-170.

Resch, K., &Schrittesser, I. (2023). Using the Service-Learning approach to bridge the gap between theory and practice in teacher education. *International Journal of Inclusive Education,* 27(10), 1118-1132.

Russell, T. (2017). Improving the quality of practicum learning: Self-study of a faculty member's role in practicum supervision. *Studying Teacher Education*, 13(2), 193-209.

Sage, K. (2022). Zone of proximal development.

Salm, T. L., Johner, R., &Luhanga, F. (2016). Determining Student Competency in Field Placements: An Emerging Theoretical Model. *Canadian Journal for the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning,* 7(1), 5.

Sanchez, H. S., & Rodrigues, L. D. A. D. (2024). Pedagogical intentions behind teacher written feedback: The perspectives and practices of an English language teacher educator in Argentina. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes,* 101370.

Scott, F. J., & Willison, D. (2021). Students' reflections on an employability skills provision. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 45(8), 1118-1133.

Shah Bukhari, S. K. U., Said, H., Gul, R., & Ibna Seraj, P. M. (2022). Barriers to sustainability at Pakistan public universities and the way forward. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education, 23(4)*, 865-886. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSHE-09-2021-0340

Singh, A. K., Rind, I. A., &Sabur, Z. (2021). Continuous professional development of school teachers: Experiences of Bangladesh, India, and Pakistan. *In Handbook of education systems in South Asia* (pp. 1355-1380). Singapore: Springer Singapore.

Slade, M. L., Burnham, T. J., Catalana, S. M., & Waters, T. (2019). The Impact of Reflective Practice on Teacher Candidates' Learning. *International Journal for the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning,* 13(2), 15.

Stahl, G., Sharplin, E., &Kehrwald, B. (2017). *Real-time coaching and pre-service teacher education.* Springer.

Tufail, M., Gul, R., & Ali, H. (2024). Humble Leadership and Knowledge Hiding: Mediating role of Psychological Empowerment. *Journal of Business & Economics, 16(1)*, 102-115.

Weber, K. E., Gold, B., Prilop, C. N., &Kleinknecht, M. (2018). Promoting pre-service teachers' professional vision of classroom management during practical school training: Effects of a

structured online-and video-based self-reflection and feedback intervention. *Teaching and teacher education,* 76, 39-49.

Wu, Y., &Schunn, C. D. (2021). The effects of providing and receiving peer feedback on writing performance and learning of secondary school students. *American Educational Research Journal,* 58(3), 492-526.

Zhou, G., Gul, R., & Tufail, M. (2022). Does servant leadership stimulate work engagement? The moderate role of trust in the leader. *Frontiers in Psychology, 13*, 925732.